



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday  
14th December 2022, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Sir Timothy John Le Cocq.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Connétable Michael Keith Jackson of St. Brelade – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.54 a.m.)  
Connétable Marcus O’Donnel Troy of St. Clement – ill  
Deputy Mary Rose Le Hegarat of St. Helier North – excused attendance  
Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Mary, St. Ouen and St. Peter – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.54 a.m.)  
Deputy Hilary Louise Jeune of St. John, St. Lawrence and Trinity – absent on States business (arrived in the Chamber at 11.17 a.m.)

---

Prayers

---

**Standing Order 55A – remote participation**

THE STATES, with reference to their Act dated 14th September 2021, in which they had agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams (until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order), assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams.

**Notification of lodged propositions**

Assembly approval for supplementary planning guidance.  
Lodged: 14th December 2022, *Deputy M.R. Scott of St. Brelade.*

P.114/2022.

**Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee, agreed that the Assembly would meet until 8.00 p.m. on both Thursday 15th and Friday 16th December 2022, with a short adjournment at 5.30 p.m. on each day.

**Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 P.97/2022**

THE STATES, resuming consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’ (P.97/2022), as amended, resumed consideration of an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(20) and, adopting the amendment, agreed that –

in paragraph (b), after the words “those revised approvals”, there should be inserted the words “, except that –

- i. to refer to their Act of 7th October 2021, in which they approved the funding of Our Hospital through borrowing (external financing), and to agree that such approval extends

to the funding of ongoing work on the development of future healthcare facilities during 2023; and

- ii. in Summary Table 2, the “Borrowing for Our Hospital” should be renamed “Borrowing for Healthcare facilities”, and the maximum amount which may be borrowed for these purposes be set at £90,071,000, with the change to approval in Summary Table 2 amended to £-665,929,000 with the figure in each of the columns headed 2023, 2024, 2025 and 2026 in Summary Table 2 to be amended accordingly to reflect this change”;

in paragraph (c), after the words “of the Law”, there should be inserted the words “, except that, in Summary Table 3, the transfer from the Strategic Reserve to the Consolidated Fund should be amended as follows –

- i. the transfer for Hospital capital should be amended to £51,500,000 for 2023 and zero in all future years; and
- ii. the transfer for Hospital borrowing should be amended to £4,200,000 in each of 2023 and 2024, £3,900,000 in 2025 and £3,500,000 in 2026”;

in paragraph (d), after the words “to the Report”, there should be inserted the words “, except that in Summary Table 4 –

- i. the Total Project Approval for Our Hospital shall be amended to £77,116,000 with the Change amended to £-727,384,000; and
- ii. the following row shall be added to the end of the table, with ‘Healthcare facilities’ to include £8,860,000 spent in 2022 on Les Quennevais under the Our Hospital Head of Expenditure –

<b>£'000</b>	<b>Spons Dept</b>	<b>Supply Dept</b>	<b>Previous Approval</b>	<b>Total Project Approval</b>	<b>Change</b>
Healthcare facilities	HCS	IHE	-	60,360	60,360

in paragraph (e), after the words “of the Report”, there should be inserted the words “, except that –

- i. in Summary Table 5(i), the Head of Expenditure for Our Hospital – Financing Costs should be replaced with the following –

<b>£'000</b>	<b>Income</b>	<b>Expenditure</b>	<b>Head of Expenditure</b>
Healthcare facilities - financing costs	-	4,200	4,200

- ii. in Summary Table 5(ii), the Head of Expenditure for Our Hospital should be replaced with the following –

<b>£'000</b>	<b>Major Project</b>	<b>Sponsor Department</b>	<b>Supply Department</b>	<b>2023 Estimate</b>
Healthcare facilities	M	HCS	IHE	51,500

in paragraph (i), the existing paragraph should be designated as new paragraph (j) and the following paragraph inserted as paragraph (i) –

“(i) to refer to their act of 7th October 2021, in which they agreed to amend the Strategic Reserve Fund policy, so as to allow the Fund to be used to support the delivery of Our Hospital and to agree that the policy should be amended to allow the Fund to also be used to support the ongoing work on the development of future healthcare facilities proposed to be undertaken during 2023 and the borrowing costs for such work.”; and

in paragraph (i), re-designated as paragraph (j), after the words “Appendix 3 to the Report”, there should be inserted the words

“, except that page 69 shall be amended accordingly to reflect the ongoing work on the development of future healthcare facilities during 2023,”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 33**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**CONTRE: 12**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy M.R. Scott

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, commencing consideration of an amendment of the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel (P.97/2022 Amd.(4)), rejected an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.97/2022 Amd.(4)Amd.) that –

in part 1, for the words “shall be reduced to £0 for 2023 and 2024”, there should be substituted the words “shall be reduced to £4,178,000 (Revenue) and £0 (Capital) in 2023 and £3,216,000 (Revenue) and £0 (Capital) in 2024.”; and

in part 2, for the words “the General Reserve Head of Expenditure shall be reduced by £12,450,000”, there should be substituted the words “the General Reserve Head of Expenditure shall be reduced by £7,378,000” and, after the words “Digital Care Strategy”, there should be added a new sub-paragraph (b) as follows –

“(b) the Head of Expenditure for Health and Community Services shall be reduced by £894,000”

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 16**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson

**CONTRE: 29**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Connétable of St. Mary

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel, agreed that –

in paragraph (c), after the words “Article 9(2)(b) of the Law”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that –

(a) the transfers from the Health Insurance Fund to the Consolidated Fund (Revenue) and Consolidated Fund (Capital) shall be reduced to £0 for 2023 and 2024”; and

in paragraph (e), after the words “of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that –

- (a) the General Reserve Head of Expenditure shall be reduced by £12,450,000 for the purposes of funding the Jersey Care Model, the Jersey Care Model – Digital Systems and the Digital Care Strategy”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 31****CONTRE: 13****ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier Central (P.97/2022 Amd.(16)) that –

in paragraph (c), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Table 3 to the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that a new line should be inserted in Summary Table 3 to include a transfer of £6.5m from the Health Insurance Fund to the Consolidated Fund to allocate funds for the provision of a scheme to allow Islanders with multi-morbidity to receive G.P. consultations or other primary health interventions at a reduced rate of patient co-payment”; and

in paragraph (e), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i) the Head of Expenditure for Health and Community Services should be increased by £6.5m to allocate funds for the provision of a scheme to allow Islanders with multi-morbidity to receive G.P. consultations or other primary health interventions at a reduced rate of patient co-payment”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy L.J Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**CONTRE: 32**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy C.F. Labey  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and, adopting an amendment of Deputy Carina Soares Alves of St. Helier Central (P.97/2022 Amd.(18)), agreed that –

in paragraph (c), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Table 3 to the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that a new line should be inserted in Summary Table 3 to include a transfer of £800,000 from the Health Insurance Fund to the Consolidated Fund to allocate funds for the provision of a scheme to allow children and young people from 0 years to 17 years of age to receive free G.P. consultations;”; and

in paragraph (e), after the words “Appendix 2 – Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 5(i) the Head of Expenditure for Health and Community Services should be increased by £800,000 to allocate funds for the provision of a scheme to allow children and young people from 0 years to 17 years of age to receive free G.P. consultations;”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 24**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Deputy G..P. Southern  
 Deputy M. Tadier  
 Deputy S.G. Luce  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hégarat  
 Deputy R.J. Ward  
 Deputy C.S. Alves  
 Deputy I. Gardiner  
 Deputy L.J. Farnham  
 Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy T.A. Coles  
 Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
 Deputy C.D. Curtis  
 Deputy L.V. Feltham  
 Deputy H.L. Jeune  
 Deputy R.S. Kovacs

**CONTRE: 22**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy K.F. Morel  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst  
 Deputy K.L. Moore  
 Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
 Deputy D.J. Warr  
 Deputy H.M. Miles  
 Deputy M.R. Scott  
 Deputy J. Renouf  
 Deputy R.E. Binet  
 Deputy M.E. Millar  
 Deputy A. Howell  
 Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
 Deputy M.R. Ferey  
 Deputy A.F. Curtis  
 Deputy B. Ward  
 Deputy K.M. Wilson  
 Deputy L.K.F. Stephenson  
 Deputy M.B. Andrews

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of Deputy Mary Rose Scott of St. Brelade (P.97/2022 Amd.(12)) that, in paragraph (e), after the words “Summary Tables 5(i) and (ii) of the Report”, there should be inserted the words –

“, except that in Summary Table 5(i) the Heads of Expenditure for the Department for the Economy shall be reduced by £700,000 on the basis that New Revenue Expenditure Growth will not be allocated to Jersey Business in 2023”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 3**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet  
 Deputy M.R. Scott

**CONTRE: 43**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Ouen

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy G..P. Southern  
Deputy C.F. Labey  
Deputy M. Tadier  
Deputy S.G. Luce  
Deputy K.F. Morel  
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat  
Deputy S.M. Ahier  
Deputy R.J. Ward  
Deputy C.S. Alves  
Deputy I. Gardiner  
Deputy I.J. Gorst  
Deputy L.J Farnham  
Deputy K.L. Moore  
Deputy S.Y. Mézec  
Deputy P.F.C. Ozouf  
Deputy P.M. Bailhache  
Deputy T.A. Coles  
Deputy B.B.S.V.M. Porée  
Deputy D.J. Warr  
Deputy H.M. Miles  
Deputy J. Renouf  
Deputy C.D. Curtis  
Deputy L.V. Feltham  
Deputy R.E. Binet  
Deputy H.L. Jeune  
Deputy M.E. Millar  
Deputy A. Howell  
Deputy T.J.A. Binet  
Deputy M.R. Ferey  
Deputy R.S. Kovacs  
Deputy A.F. Curtis  
Deputy B. Ward  
Deputy K.M. Wilson  
Deputy L.K.F Stephenson  
Deputy M.B. Andrews

### **Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel (P.97/2022 Amd.(4)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’ (P.97/2022) and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mrs. Lisa-Marie Hart, Greffier of the States. The Bailiff returned to the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier Central (P.97/2022 Amd.(16)) to the same proposition and the meeting continued under his Presidency.

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 15th December 2022 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’ (P.97/2022), as amended, and the other outstanding propositions listed for the meeting.



THE STATES rose at 5.25 p.m.

**W.J.C. MILLOW**

*Deputy Greffier of the States*